

*Beiträge zur Geschichte des Paulinerordens*, hrsg. von Kaspar Elm in Verbindung mit Dieter R. Bauer, Elmar L. Kuhn, Gábor Sarbak, Lorenz Weirich, Berlin 2000. Duncker & Humblot. Berliner Historische Studien, Band 32, Ordensstudien XIV, 333 pp.

The Paulite Order that has played such an important role in the religious life of Poland, for many reasons (language barrier, dispersion of sources, limitation of central-European researchers' contacts after World War II) has not attracted a lot

of interest of European historians. The work under review aims to correct this situation and introduce the Paulite issue to European historiography. The basis of this work is a set of dissertations from the conference organized in Weingarten, Germany, in 1996, although not all papers delivered there have been included, and the work has been enriched by a number of additional articles. The work's design is to present the results of research carried out so far and to inspire further works, rather than to provide a synthesis of the Order's history.

The articles centre round the following issues: the role of eremitic orders in 13th c. Europe and the eremitic tradition of the Paulites, their history in the Kingdom of Hungary within its historical borders and the history of the Swabian province. One article has been devoted to the Paulite Monastery in Rome. What links the two branches of the Order (the Hungarian and the Swabian) presented more broadly in the book, is the similar character of the rise of their monastic organizations that disciplined the spontaneously emerging eremitic movement, the breakdown of monastic life in the 16th c. due to external circumstances (the Reformation, the Turkish invasion of Hungary) and its revival in the 17th c., a spectacular example of which was the rise of a Paulite monastery in Pest. What strikes us unpleasantly in this context is leaving out of account the Polish province which played a significant role as a second monastic province and which, in contrast to Hungary and Swabia, did not suffer such a crisis in the 16th c. A more extensive presentation of Polish Paulites would show better the diversified situation of this Order in various European countries. Since the Polish province has been left out of account, the reader may think that the only important Paulite sanctuary was the St. Lawrence Monastery in Buda that since 1381 preserved the relics of St. Paul the Hermit, while the Virgin Mary's sanctuary in Jasna Góra near Częstochowa and the centre of the bishop and martyr St. Stanislaus' cult in Skalka near Cracow escape his attention. The omission of the Jasna Góra sanctuary is important not only because of the significance of this church, but because here the object of cult was a holy picture and not relics. The cult of pictures in the Western Church gained more significance in late medieval and modern times than the earlier prevailing cult of relics. The fact that the relics of St. Paul the Hermit were brought to Buda at the same time that the Jasna Góra Monastery, holding the miraculous icon of the Virgin Mary, was founded, shows the multifariousness of Paulite spirituality and its opening to new forms of cult. Therefore it should be regretted that the papers of Polish authors attending the conference have not been included in the book. This regret has been expressed, too, by Kaspar Elm, the editor, in the preface to this volume. This gap is not made up for by the fact that the bibliography mentions many articles concerning the history of Polish Paulites, mostly, however, in Polish, therefore difficult of access to West-European historians.

The opening article by Kaspar Elm shows the position and role of the Paulites against the background of monastic life in late medieval times. The author analyses the origin of the Paulites, finally emerging as an order at the beginning of the 14th c., against the background of a largely diversified group of orders of minor significance and with a relatively small number of monasteries, among which he also ranks orders of eremitic origin (e. g. the Servites) as well as the Crusaders' Orders that emerged in Europe (Crusaders with a Red Star, Canons Regular of St. Martyrs' Penance, the Holy Cross Order of the Low Countries). As in any classification, here too, it may be subject to doubt whether we are justified in classifying eremitic orders operating far from the cities in the same group as active urban orders, which followed the model worked out during the Crusades. Certainly the group of orders reduced to a common denominator by Kaspar Elm were linked by the fact that they developed intensively in late medieval times, and substantially complemented the activity of great mendicant orders, and due to their diversity and adaptive abilities could respond to various religious and social needs. It was a characteristic feature of this group of orders that they created small monasteries, sometimes consisting of a few friars, and were marked by

eclecticism, which allowed them to draw on many monastic traditions; the latter feature has been emphasized by Beatrix Fűlop-Romhányi in her article devoted to Hungarian Paulites in the Middle Ages. Here we express our doubt as to the value of classifications, which are very ambiguous, especially if they concern eclectic orders with great adaptive abilities. The Paulites retained their eremitic character the longest of all the orders, by shunning pastoral functions, a decision which did not stop them from gaining large popularity.

Stefan Rebenich's article on St. Paul the Hermit's life written by St. Jerome is an excellent introduction to the monastic tradition. The author is quite right in distancing himself from the controversies about the historicity of Paul and the historical credibility of his life, and focusses on the message of this work. The model of a life of an ascetic and hermit — a white martyr, initiated by St. Jerome in the presentation of St. Paul's life, proposed at a time when bloody martyrdom became inaccessible to believers, became one of the patterns of Christian life for many ages. This was the pattern to which the Paulites referred as well.

János Bak in his article discussing the circumstances of the rise of this order in Hungary shows that the emergence and the initial period of the Order's development coincided with the economic development of the Kingdom of Hungary and the period when Central Europe started to play some part in the life of the Continent. He also presents the political background of the activity of the first generations of the Paulites, especially support given to them by the Angevin dynasty, who not long before came to power in Hungary and who treated the promotion of their own religious institution as an important demonstration of their authority. The development of the Order in medieval Hungary is discussed by Beatrix Fűlop-Romhányi who gives a profound analysis of the process of its foundation, taking into account such circumstances as periods of the most intensive foundation movement and its slow down, the milieu of the founders (an important role of the magnates and lack of support from the burghers), the distribution of the network of monasteries over the area of the Kingdom of Hungary and its connection with natural conditions, the numbers of monasteries and of the whole population of the Paulites in the medieval Kingdom of Hungary. It is to the article's credit that it juxtaposes the process of the foundation of the Paulites with the Franciscan-Observants and points out the differences (the Franciscan-Observants operating in towns numbered towards the end of the Middle Ages about three times as many friars as the Paulites). However, the Order's activity could have been given a more extensive discussion.

This gap is filled by articles devoted to some aspects of this activity. József Tőrök discusses the liturgy of the Order in Hungary. He points out its eclectic character, due to which this liturgy, based above all on that of Esztergom Cathedral, also contained some elements of the liturgy of Canons Regular, Dominicans, Romans as well as those independently elaborated by the Order. It is possible that this eclecticism, too, testifying to an ability to adapt, was one of the causes of the Paulites' success. The results of archeological explorations in Hungarian Paulite monasteries, above all the remnants of the St. Lawrence Monastery in Buda, presented in Zoltán Benčze's article, provided the author with a basis for presenting some aspects of the life of Paulite monasteries. The successive stages of the redevelopment of the St. Lawrence Monastery reflect the evolution of this centre, initially a secluded hermitage, then the central monastery of the Paulites, and finally the goal of pilgrimages where relics of St. Paul the Hermit were preserved. Beatrix Fűlop-Romhányi's article finds here its complement in the presentation of the architectural relics of smaller monasteries, which verifies her information on the size of monasteries and their adaptation for their tasks.

The intellectual culture of the Order is presented by Gábor Sarbak in an article whose title announces an exclusive limitation of its subject to the matters of book culture. Nevertheless, the content of this work goes far beyond the subject

so delineated, since actually the author discusses all the kinds of communication in writing applied in the Order. The article makes us realize how varied was the documentation that arose as a result of official functions connected with the Order's management (correspondence, summaries of visitations, permissions to depart from the monastery, etc.). This shows that a monastic community that did not even cherish high intellectual ambitions had to possess a suitable number of literate monks, so that official functions required by the law could be formally fulfilled. While discussing library collections in the strict sense of the word, Sarbak presents not only their subjects, which, at any rate, can only be approximately reconstructed, but also the ways in which monks made use of those books (pen footnotes added in the margins of sets of homilies, pads for displaying liturgical books at the altar). The author also shows that while in the 14th and in the first half of the 15th c. the intellectual level of the monks was low, which did not favour their own literary activity, the clericalization of the Order and pastoral work taken up there to a larger extent at the turn of the 15th c., resulted in essential changes in this respect. This had led to the emergence of a group of well-educated friars and of works written in the milieu of this monastery such as its history by Gregory Gyöngyösi and the life of St. Paul the Hermit by Valentine Hadnagy.

The revival of the Paulites' monastic life in the areas liberated from the Turkish rule is presented by Gabriel Adriányi's contribution concerning the Paulite monastery in Pest, founded right after the liberation of the city. The successive stages of the construction of the church and monastery have been presented with much thoroughness, but it is a pity the author does not offer a more profound analysis of the role this monastery played in the re-catholicization of the town and the reconstruction of its ecclesiastical structures.

The articles about the Swabian province are mostly focussed on its modern history. The profound dissertation by Elmar L. Kuhn discusses, it is true, the rise of this province in the 14th c. as a result of the adoption of the Paulite rule by hermits who previously lived far from one another, as well as the almost complete downfall of this branch of the Order during the Reformation, yet its main subject is the history of Swabian Paulites in the 17th and 18th cc. The author presents the organization of this province, the extraction of the monks and their activity. However, the most interesting problem the article touches upon is the question of the contacts of the Swabian branch of the Order with its Hungarian headquarters, tiresome for geographical reasons; hence the Swabian province tried to become independent of the power of the generals of the Order, by subjecting themselves to that of the bishop of Constance or by adopting the rule of another order, which they failed to do because of the counteraction of Paulite generals. However, these conflicts show how difficult it was to maintain the unity of this small monastic community, split into distant houses. Magda Fischer's dissertation on the libraries of Swabian Paulites in the 17th and 18th cc., based on a solid analysis of material, shows the intellectual horizons and interests of the monks. Both dissertations give rise to a picture of a community which played a secondary role in the religious and cultural life of the Constancian diocese in the 17th and 18th cc., however, because of its exotic, from the point of view of the local environment, and eremitic origin, it broadened the horizons and enriched the spirituality of local believers. These dissertations are complemented by two histories in verse of the monastery at Langnau, written in the middle of the 16th, and the first quarter of the 18th c., published by Dirk Kottke, which let us know the historical tradition cherished by this monastery.

Lorenz Weirich presents the history of the Paulite monastery active in Rome in the 15th and 16th cc., and emphasizes the role played by the Paulites of the Apostolic See (Penitentiaries) and the political conditions that accompanied the rise of this monastery, as well as its significance for the education of monks.

The work is complemented by an extensive bibliography, compiled by Gábor Sarbak, which can be helpful to all the future researchers into the history of the Paulites. It takes into account publications concerning Paulites from all the

countries where they were active, also those to which no articles have been devoted in this book. The asset of this bibliography is the fact that it also includes works in Hungarian or in Slavonic languages, thus promoting the achievements of historical sciences in Central European countries. Publications have been arranged in alphabetical order, without any divisions, e. g. into primary sources and secondary literature, or old and new printed publications, therefore this material is a little chaotic and difficult to use.

Among minor editorial defects of this work one should point out the lack of uniformity in the use of the names of localities lying in the area of the former Kingdom of Hungary, which now belong to other states (Hungary, Slovakia, the Ukraine, Croatia, Rumania) and have new names in their languages; hence the same locality appears in different articles under different names. Doubts in identification are not dispelled by the index of place names where not all language versions are cited, and the states to which these localities now belong are not mentioned, either.

The work under review did not assume to be a synthesis of the history of the Paulites, and does not fulfil this aim. The issues discussed in it may rather serve as examples. They show the diversity and extensiveness of the issues concerned with the history of the Paulites, present the state of research, inspire further research and provide some basis in this respect. The temporal and geographical dispersion of the topics of articles from this collection gives us an idea of the extent of the Paulites' activity and shows their connection with various phenomena of religious and political life of late-medieval and early modern Europe. It should be regretted, however, that many essential questions from the history of the Paulites (their activity in Poland, the way they received *devotionis modernae*), have been left out of account; this could have substantially enriched the issues raised in this work. The fact that the history of an order originating from Central Europe, which created forms of religious life that were also attractive to Western Europe, has been presented in a Congress language is certainly valuable. The Paulites' success reflects the evolution of civilization in Central Europe, which in late medieval times fully took part in the cultural life of Europe as a whole. Emphasis has been placed on the important traits of the Paulites, i. e. their ability to adapt to various conditions that enabled them to undertake work in various regions and situations. It is also important that the work emphasizes the significance of an order that played a secondary role, since such communities, side by side with orders that had a dense network of monasteries and a great number of friars, also exerted their influence on the religious aspect of Europe. The work under review shows many essential traits of the Paulites' activity, in this way delineating the directions of further research and creates a solid foundation for such investigations.

Maria Starnawska